

**Finance Department**

Robert Daddario
Finance Director

MEMORANDUM

To: Rafael G. Casals, Town Manager

From: Robert Daddario, Finance Director

Date: April 17, 2019

Re: Recommendation pursuant to RFQ #19-02, Financial Advisory Services

The Town Council on January 16, 2019 via Resolution # 19-03 authorized staff to issue an Request for Qualifications (RFQ) # 19-02: Financial Advisory Services. The RFQ had a due date and time of March 14, 2019 at 3:00 p.m. The Town received five (5) sealed bid packages from potential firms which were publicly opened at Town Hall. The bid opening summary is provided as Attachment "I".

An Evaluation Selection Committee was created by the Town Manager to evaluate the proposals and consisted of the following Town staff:

- Robert Daddario, Finance Director (Committee Chair),
- Alfredo Quintero, Public Works Director, and
- Lakeesha Morris, Grants Coordinator.

The Selection Committee met on March 20, 2019 at 3 p.m. at Town Hall to evaluate the written proposals submitted. Five responses were evaluated, four of which received average scores in excess of 93 (the average score of the fifth response was below 88). Each committee member's evaluation form is attached (Attachment "II"). The written proposal, pursuant to the RFQ, was weighted as 75% of a respondent's total score.

The top 4 ranked respondents were invited to make oral presentations pursuant to the RFQ. Oral presentations were made on March 27, 2019, commencing at 9 a.m. at Town Hall. The oral presentation, pursuant to the RFQ, was weighted as 25% of a respondent's total score. Each committee member's evaluation form is attached (Attachment "III").



After tabulating the Selection Committee's evaluation forms for both the written RFQ response and the oral presentation, and weighting as outlined in the RFQ, the respondents were ranked as follows:

1. Estrada Hinojosa & Co., Inc. (95.67 points)
2. Public Resources Advisory Group (95.00 points)
3. (tied) Hilltop Securities and Masterson Advisors (93.67 points each)

In addition to including each committee member's evaluation form mentioned above, attached please find a summary tabulation sheet calculating each respondent's total score based on the weighting of the written response score and the oral presentation score (Attachment "IV").

Although all four respondents are qualified firms for the scope of work outlined in RFQ#19-02, the Selection Committee recommends that the top ranked respondent, Estrada Hinojosa & Co., Inc., be selected as the "Financial Advisor" (consultant) to provide financial advisory services to the Town.

ATTACHMENT(S)

- Attachment "I" – Bid Opening Summary Sheet
- Attachment "II" – Evaluation Forms - Written Response
- Attachment "III" – Evaluation Forms – Oral Presentation
- Attachment "IV" – Summary Score Tabulation Sheet



TOWN OF CUTLER BAY
BID OPENING - RFQ #19-02
FINANCIAL ADVISORY SERVICES
THURSDAY, MARCH 14, 2019 – 3:00PM

Bid Requirements:

of Copies: 6 (1 Orig & 5 Copies)

Bid Bond or Money Order: _____

USB or CD: 1 USB

<u>NAME</u>	<u>ADDRESS</u>	<u>Total Bid Amt.</u>	<u>No. Copies Submitted</u>	<u>Bond</u>	<u>Money Order</u>	<u>USB or CD</u>
Public Resources Advisory Group	150 Second Ave, Suite 400 St. Petersburg, FL 33704		1 Original 5 Copies			1 USB
PFM Financial Advisors, LLC	2222 Ponce De Leon Blvd, 3 rd Floor Coral Gables, FL 33134		1 Original 5 Copies			1 USB
Estrada Hinojosa & Co., Inc.	2937 SW 27 AVE, Suite 200 B Miami, FL 33133		1 Original 5 Copies			1 USB
Masterson Advisors	5323 Millenia Lakes Blvd, Suite 300 Orlando, FL 32839		1 Original 5 Copies			1 USB
Hilltop Securities	450 S Orange Ave, Suite 460 Orlando, FL 32801		1 Original 5 Copies			1 USB

Revised – February 2019



RFQ #19-02, Financial Advisory Services

Committee Member Evaluation Forms

RFQ Written Response Scoring Sheets



**Town of Cutler Bay
Finance Department**

10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

Firm's Name: **Hilltop Securities**

Committee Member: L. Morris-Moreau

**RFQ #19-02
FINANCIAL ADVISORY SERVICES
Evaluation Criteria**

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
CREDENTIALS, PROFESSIONAL CERTIFICATIONS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF PROJECT MANAGER AND KEY MEMBERS OF THE TEAM	40	40
QUALITY OF THE PROJECTS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF THE RESPONDENT(S) IN PROVIDING SIMILAR SERVICES TO ENTITIES COMPARABLE TO THE TOWN	25	25
RESPONDENT'S TRACK RECORD OF ON TIME AND WITHIN BUDGET PROJECT PERFORMANCE	25	25
COMPLIANCE WITH THE RESPONSE PREPARATION AND SUBMISSION REQUIREMENTS	10	10
TOTAL POINTS	100	93

Additional Notes:

Conflict of Interest disclosures + legal events/disciplinary action history was disclosed at end of proposal. How might this affect the Town? Is there a potential COI? Multiple findings + legal actions.



**Town of Cutler Bay
Finance Department**

10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

Firm's Name: **PFM Financial Advisors, LLC**

Committee Member: Lakeisha Morris

**RFQ #19-02
FINANCIAL ADVISORY SERVICES
Evaluation Criteria**

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
CREDENTIALS, PROFESSIONAL CERTIFICATIONS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF PROJECT MANAGER AND KEY MEMBERS OF THE TEAM	40	35
QUALITY OF THE PROJECTS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF THE RESPONDENT(S) IN PROVIDING SIMILAR SERVICES TO ENTITIES COMPARABLE TO THE TOWN	25	25
RESPONDENT'S TRACK RECORD OF ON TIME AND WITHIN BUDGET PROJECT PERFORMANCE	25	23
COMPLIANCE WITH THE RESPONSE PREPARATION AND SUBMISSION REQUIREMENTS	10	10
TOTAL POINTS	100	93

Additional Notes:

provided exceptions to qualifications. Provided links to certificates instead of copies. Unclear on disclosures of COI or legal (pg. 12). 3 yr chart was difficult to read.



**Town of Cutler Bay
Finance Department**

10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

Firm's Name: **Estrada Hinojosa & Co., Inc.**

Committee Member: Lakeisha Morris

**RFQ #19-02
FINANCIAL ADVISORY SERVICES
Evaluation Criteria**

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
CREDENTIALS, PROFESSIONAL CERTIFICATIONS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF PROJECT MANAGER AND KEY MEMBERS OF THE TEAM	40	40
QUALITY OF THE PROJECTS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF THE RESPONDENT(S) IN PROVIDING SIMILAR SERVICES TO ENTITIES COMPARABLE TO THE TOWN	25	25
RESPONDENT'S TRACK RECORD OF ON TIME AND WITHIN BUDGET PROJECT PERFORMANCE	25	25
COMPLIANCE WITH THE RESPONSE PREPARATION AND SUBMISSION REQUIREMENTS	10	9
TOTAL POINTS	100	99

Additional Notes:

Did not provide info about disclosure events (COI or legal)
Provided good examples of their plan of action specific to Cutler Bay.

Firm's Name: **Masterson Advisors**
**Town of Cutler Bay
Finance Department**

10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

Committee Member: L. Morris

**RFQ #19-02
FINANCIAL ADVISORY SERVICES
Evaluation Criteria**

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
CREDENTIALS, PROFESSIONAL CERTIFICATIONS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF PROJECT MANAGER AND KEY MEMBERS OF THE TEAM	40	40
QUALITY OF THE PROJECTS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF THE RESPONDENT(S) IN PROVIDING SIMILAR SERVICES TO ENTITIES COMPARABLE TO THE TOWN	25	25
RESPONDENT'S TRACK RECORD OF ON TIME AND WITHIN BUDGET PROJECT PERFORMANCE	25	25
COMPLIANCE WITH THE RESPONSE PREPARATION AND SUBMISSION REQUIREMENTS	10	8
TOTAL POINTS	100	98

Additional Notes:

Provided general conflict of interest statement. NO COI reported and NO History of legal or disciplinary events.
#11 asked for copies of licenses and certifications - bidder provided links.



Town of Cutler Bay
Finance Department
 10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
 Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
 Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
 Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

Firm's Name: **Public Resources Advisory Group**

Committee Member: Lakeisha Morris

RFQ #19-02
FINANCIAL ADVISORY SERVICES
Evaluation Criteria

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
CREDENTIALS, PROFESSIONAL CERTIFICATIONS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF PROJECT MANAGER AND KEY MEMBERS OF THE TEAM	40	40
QUALITY OF THE PROJECTS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF THE RESPONDENT(S) IN PROVIDING SIMILAR SERVICES TO ENTITIES COMPARABLE TO THE TOWN	25	25
RESPONDENT'S TRACK RECORD OF ON TIME AND WITHIN BUDGET PROJECT PERFORMANCE	25	25
COMPLIANCE WITH THE RESPONSE PREPARATION AND SUBMISSION REQUIREMENTS	10	10 ⁱⁿ
TOTAL POINTS	100	100 100

Additional Notes:

Provided 6 samples of successful projects plus worked on City of Homestead transit project (Sidor). Did not provide disclosures or statement regarding conflict of interest or legal concerns. None reported to SEC, as well.



Town of Cutler Bay
Finance Department
 10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
 Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
 Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
 Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

Firm's Name: HILLTOP SECURITIES

Committee Member: ALFREDO QUINTERO

RFQ #19-02
FINANCIAL ADVISORY SERVICES
Evaluation Criteria

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
CREDENTIALS, PROFESSIONAL CERTIFICATIONS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF PROJECT MANAGER AND KEY MEMBERS OF THE TEAM	40	40
QUALITY OF THE PROJECTS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF THE RESPONDENT(S) IN PROVIDING SIMILAR SERVICES TO ENTITIES COMPARABLE TO THE TOWN	25	25
RESPONDENT'S TRACK RECORD OF ON TIME AND WITHIN BUDGET PROJECT PERFORMANCE	25	25
COMPLIANCE WITH THE RESPONSE PREPARATION AND SUBMISSION REQUIREMENTS	10	10
TOTAL POINTS	100	100

Additional Notes:

PERFECT SUBMITTAL. ITEMS 1 THROUGH 9 PRESENTED/COMPLETED IN 18 PAGES.

**Town of Cutler Bay****Finance Department**

10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105

Cutler Bay, Florida 33189

Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251

Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.govFirm's Name: ESTRADA . HINOJOSACommittee Member: ALFREDO QUINTERO

RFQ #19-02
FINANCIAL ADVISORY SERVICES
Evaluation Criteria

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
CREDENTIALS, PROFESSIONAL CERTIFICATIONS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF PROJECT MANAGER AND KEY MEMBERS OF THE TEAM	40	40
QUALITY OF THE PROJECTS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF THE RESPONDENT(S) IN PROVIDING SIMILAR SERVICES TO ENTITIES COMPARABLE TO THE TOWN	25	25
RESPONDENT'S TRACK RECORD OF ON TIME AND WITHIN BUDGET PROJECT PERFORMANCE	25	25
COMPLIANCE WITH THE RESPONSE PREPARATION AND SUBMISSION REQUIREMENTS	10	10
TOTAL POINTS	100	100

Additional Notes:

PERFECT SUBMITTAL . ITEMS 1 THROUGH 9 PRESENTED/COMPLETED IN 19 PAGES.

**Town of Cutler Bay****Finance Department**

10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105

Cutler Bay, Florida 33189

Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251

Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.govFirm's Name: PUBLIC RESOURCES ADVISORY GROUPCommittee Member: ALFREDO QUINTERO

RFQ #19-02
FINANCIAL ADVISORY SERVICES
Evaluation Criteria

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
CREDENTIALS, PROFESSIONAL CERTIFICATIONS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF PROJECT MANAGER AND KEY MEMBERS OF THE TEAM	40	40
QUALITY OF THE PROJECTS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF THE RESPONDENT(S) IN PROVIDING SIMILAR SERVICES TO ENTITIES COMPARABLE TO THE TOWN	25	25
RESPONDENT'S TRACK RECORD OF ON TIME AND WITHIN BUDGET PROJECT PERFORMANCE	25	25
COMPLIANCE WITH THE RESPONSE PREPARATION AND SUBMISSION REQUIREMENTS	10	9
TOTAL POINTS	100	99

Additional Notes:

TOO MANY PAGES PRESENTED IN ITEM 1 (A COVER PAGE, A 2ND COVER, A COVER LETTER).
 ITEM 6 IS MISSING PART b. ITEMS 1 THROUGH 9 PRESENTED/COMPUTED IN 19 PAGES.

**Town of Cutler Bay****Finance Department**

10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105

Cutler Bay, Florida 33189

Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251

Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.govFirm's Name: PFMCommittee Member: ALFREDO QUINTERO

RFQ #19-02
FINANCIAL ADVISORY SERVICES
Evaluation Criteria

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
CREDENTIALS, PROFESSIONAL CERTIFICATIONS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF PROJECT MANAGER AND KEY MEMBERS OF THE TEAM	40	38
QUALITY OF THE PROJECTS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF THE RESPONDENT(S) IN PROVIDING SIMILAR SERVICES TO ENTITIES COMPARABLE TO THE TOWN	25	25
RESPONDENT'S TRACK RECORD OF ON TIME AND WITHIN BUDGET PROJECT PERFORMANCE	25	25
COMPLIANCE WITH THE RESPONSE PREPARATION AND SUBMISSION REQUIREMENTS	10	9
TOTAL POINTS	100	97

Additional Notes:

TABLE OF CONTENTS IS ITEM 2 IN RFP, SUBMITTED AS ITEM 1. COVER LETTER IS ITEM 1 IN RFP, SUBMITTED AS ITEM 2, AND SUBMITTED 2 PAGES INSTEAD OF 1 (ADDITIONAL PAGE TITLED "ABOUT PFM"). ITEM 4 (KEY EMPLOYEES) SUBMITTED 1 PAGE INSTEAD OF 2 PAGES. ITEMS 1 THROUGH 9 PRESENTED/COMPLETED IN 19 PAGES, BUT REFER TO PREVIOUS NOTES.



**Town of Cutler Bay
Finance Department**

10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

Firm's Name: MASTERSON ADVISORS

Committee Member: ALFREDO QUINTERO

**RFQ #19-02
FINANCIAL ADVISORY SERVICES
Evaluation Criteria**

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
CREDENTIALS, PROFESSIONAL CERTIFICATIONS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF PROJECT MANAGER AND KEY MEMBERS OF THE TEAM	40	38
QUALITY OF THE PROJECTS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF THE RESPONDENT(S) IN PROVIDING SIMILAR SERVICES TO ENTITIES COMPARABLE TO THE TOWN	25	25
RESPONDENT'S TRACK RECORD OF ON TIME AND WITHIN BUDGET PROJECT PERFORMANCE	25	25
COMPLIANCE WITH THE RESPONSE PREPARATION AND SUBMISSION REQUIREMENTS	10	7
TOTAL POINTS	100	95

Additional Notes:

IN ITEM 4 PROVIDED 3 PAGES OF KEY EMPLOYEES INSTEAD OF 2. APPEARS ITEM 4 AND ITEM 5 WERE COMBINED IN THE 3 PAGES. IN ITEM 6 DID NOT LABEL PARTS A, B, & C. IN ITEM 7 DID NOT LABEL PARTS A, B, C, & D. IN ITEM 8 PROVIDED 4 PAGES INSTEAD OF 3.



**Town of Cutler Bay
Finance Department**

10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

Firm's Name: **Public Resources Advisory Group**

Committee Member: Robert Daddario

**RFQ #19-02
FINANCIAL ADVISORY SERVICES
Evaluation Criteria**

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
CREDENTIALS, PROFESSIONAL CERTIFICATIONS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF PROJECT MANAGER AND KEY MEMBERS OF THE TEAM	40	37
QUALITY OF THE PROJECTS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF THE RESPONDENT(S) IN PROVIDING SIMILAR SERVICES TO ENTITIES COMPARABLE TO THE TOWN	25	20
RESPONDENT'S TRACK RECORD OF ON TIME AND WITHIN BUDGET PROJECT PERFORMANCE	25	22
COMPLIANCE WITH THE RESPONSE PREPARATION AND SUBMISSION REQUIREMENTS	10	10
TOTAL POINTS	100	89

Additional Notes:

- Seem to deal mostly with larger entities (Counties / large cities), but reference check with City of Estero was positive.



Town of Cutler Bay
Finance Department
 10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
 Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
 Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
 Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

Firm's Name: **Masterson Advisors**

Committee Member: Robert Daddario

RFQ #19-02
FINANCIAL ADVISORY SERVICES
Evaluation Criteria

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
CREDENTIALS, PROFESSIONAL CERTIFICATIONS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF PROJECT MANAGER AND KEY MEMBERS OF THE TEAM	40	37
QUALITY OF THE PROJECTS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF THE RESPONDENT(S) IN PROVIDING SIMILAR SERVICES TO ENTITIES COMPARABLE TO THE TOWN	25	21
RESPONDENT'S TRACK RECORD OF ON TIME AND WITHIN BUDGET PROJECT PERFORMANCE	25	20
COMPLIANCE WITH THE RESPONSE PREPARATION AND SUBMISSION REQUIREMENTS	10	10
TOTAL POINTS	100	88

Additional Notes:

Relatively new firm, most staff coming from Hulltop
 No mention of specific fees, on-time and within budget



Town of Cutler Bay
Finance Department
 10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
 Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
 Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
 Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

Firm's Name: **Estrada Hinojosa & Co., Inc.**

Committee Member: Robert Daddario

RFQ #19-02
FINANCIAL ADVISORY SERVICES
Evaluation Criteria

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
CREDENTIALS, PROFESSIONAL CERTIFICATIONS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF PROJECT MANAGER AND KEY MEMBERS OF THE TEAM	40	37
QUALITY OF THE PROJECTS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF THE RESPONDENT(S) IN PROVIDING SIMILAR SERVICES TO ENTITIES COMPARABLE TO THE TOWN	25	23
RESPONDENT'S TRACK RECORD OF ON TIME AND WITHIN BUDGET PROJECT PERFORMANCE	25	22
COMPLIANCE WITH THE RESPONSE PREPARATION AND SUBMISSION REQUIREMENTS	10	10
TOTAL POINTS	100	92

Additional Notes:

Lead Banker is a member of the Board of Directors and Finance Committee of Banyan Health Systems - A tenant in the Town's Town Hall Bldg. Per Town Attorney, should not in and of itself create a conflict.



Town of Cutler Bay
Finance Department
 10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
 Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
 Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
 Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

Firm's Name: **PFM Financial Advisors, LLC**

Committee Member: Robert Daddario

RFQ #19-02
FINANCIAL ADVISORY SERVICES
Evaluation Criteria

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
CREDENTIALS, PROFESSIONAL CERTIFICATIONS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF PROJECT MANAGER AND KEY MEMBERS OF THE TEAM	40	37
QUALITY OF THE PROJECTS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF THE RESPONDENT(S) IN PROVIDING SIMILAR SERVICES TO ENTITIES COMPARABLE TO THE TOWN	25	23
RESPONDENT'S TRACK RECORD OF ON TIME AND WITHIN BUDGET PROJECT PERFORMANCE	25	20
COMPLIANCE WITH THE RESPONSE PREPARATION AND SUBMISSION REQUIREMENTS	10	5
TOTAL POINTS	100	85

Additional Notes:

Made unilateral changes to terms of proposed contract and to certain required forms
No mention of specific fees, on-time and within budget



Town of Cutler Bay
Finance Department
 10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
 Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
 Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
 Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

Firm's Name: **Hilltop Securities**

Committee Member: Robert Daddario

RFQ #19-02
FINANCIAL ADVISORY SERVICES
Evaluation Criteria

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
CREDENTIALS, PROFESSIONAL CERTIFICATIONS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF PROJECT MANAGER AND KEY MEMBERS OF THE TEAM	40	36
QUALITY OF THE PROJECTS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF THE RESPONDENT(S) IN PROVIDING SIMILAR SERVICES TO ENTITIES COMPARABLE TO THE TOWN	25	23
RESPONDENT'S TRACK RECORD OF ON TIME AND WITHIN BUDGET PROJECT PERFORMANCE	25	20
COMPLIANCE WITH THE RESPONSE PREPARATION AND SUBMISSION REQUIREMENTS	10	10
TOTAL POINTS	100	89

Additional Notes:

Lost some key staff
No mention of specific fees, on-time and within budget



RFQ #19-02, Financial Advisory Services

Committee Member Evaluation Forms

RFQ Oral Presentation Scoring Sheets



Town of Cutler Bay
Finance Department
 10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
 Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
 Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
 Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

Firm's Name: **Public Resources Advisory Group**

Committee Member: Lakeesha Norris

RFQ #19-02
FINANCIAL ADVISORY SERVICES
(Oral Presentation Date – 3/27/2019)

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
CREDENTIALS, PROFESSIONAL CERTIFICATIONS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF PROJECT MANAGER AND KEY MEMBERS OF THE TEAM	40	40
QUALITY OF THE PROJECTS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF THE RESPONDENT(S) IN PROVIDING SIMILAR SERVICES TO ENTITIES COMPARABLE TO THE TOWN	25	20
RESPONDENT'S TRACK RECORD OF ON TIME AND WITHIN BUDGET PROJECT PERFORMANCE	25	20
COMPLIANCE WITH THE RESPONSE PREPARATION AND SUBMISSION REQUIREMENTS	10	10
TOTAL POINTS	100	90

Additional Notes:

Respondent's focus appears to be on larger entities, but provided good examples of work with small-mid size cities.
 No example of "on time + within budget"

Firm's Name: **Hilltop Securities**
**Town of Cutler Bay
Finance Department**

 10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
 Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
 Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
 Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov
Committee Member: Lakeisha Morris.
**RFQ #19-02
FINANCIAL ADVISORY SERVICES
(Oral Presentation Date – 3/27/2019)**

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
CREDENTIALS, PROFESSIONAL CERTIFICATIONS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF PROJECT MANAGER AND KEY MEMBERS OF THE TEAM	40	40
QUALITY OF THE PROJECTS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF THE RESPONDENT(S) IN PROVIDING SIMILAR SERVICES TO ENTITIES COMPARABLE TO THE TOWN	25	25
RESPONDENT'S TRACK RECORD OF ON TIME AND WITHIN BUDGET PROJECT PERFORMANCE	25	20
COMPLIANCE WITH THE RESPONSE PREPARATION AND SUBMISSION REQUIREMENTS	10	10
TOTAL POINTS	100	95

Additional Notes:

Did not detail "on time, within budget" project.



**Town of Cutler Bay
Finance Department**

10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

Firm's Name: **Estrada Hinojosa & Co., Inc.**

Committee Member: Lakeisha Morris

**RFQ #19-02
FINANCIAL ADVISORY SERVICES
(Oral Presentation Date – 3/27/2019)**

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
CREDENTIALS, PROFESSIONAL CERTIFICATIONS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF PROJECT MANAGER AND KEY MEMBERS OF THE TEAM	40	40
QUALITY OF THE PROJECTS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF THE RESPONDENT(S) IN PROVIDING SIMILAR SERVICES TO ENTITIES COMPARABLE TO THE TOWN	25	25
RESPONDENT'S TRACK RECORD OF ON TIME AND WITHIN BUDGET PROJECT PERFORMANCE	25	20
COMPLIANCE WITH THE RESPONSE PREPARATION AND SUBMISSION REQUIREMENTS	10	5
TOTAL POINTS	100	90

Additional Notes:

Did not detail "on time, within budget" & went over
that time.

Firm's Name: **Masterson Advisors**
**Town of Cutler Bay
Finance Department**

 10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
 Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
 Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
 Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov
Committee Member: Lakeisha Morris
**RFQ #19-02
FINANCIAL ADVISORY SERVICES
(Oral Presentation Date – 3/27/2019)**

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
CREDENTIALS, PROFESSIONAL CERTIFICATIONS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF PROJECT MANAGER AND KEY MEMBERS OF THE TEAM	40	40
QUALITY OF THE PROJECTS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF THE RESPONDENT(S) IN PROVIDING SIMILAR SERVICES TO ENTITIES COMPARABLE TO THE TOWN	25	25
RESPONDENT'S TRACK RECORD OF ON TIME AND WITHIN BUDGET PROJECT PERFORMANCE	25	20
COMPLIANCE WITH THE RESPONSE PREPARATION AND SUBMISSION REQUIREMENTS	10	10
TOTAL POINTS	100	95

Additional Notes:

Respondent presented on their successful track record. Did not detail a project that was "on time + within budget." Suggest giving a case study of a project.

Firm's Name: **Hilltop Securities**
**Town of Cutler Bay
Finance Department**

10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

Committee Member: ALFREDO QUINTANA
9:45 - 10:10 AM

**RFQ #19-02
FINANCIAL ADVISORY SERVICES
(Oral Presentation Date – 3/27/2019)**

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
CREDENTIALS, PROFESSIONAL CERTIFICATIONS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF PROJECT MANAGER AND KEY MEMBERS OF THE TEAM	40	40
QUALITY OF THE PROJECTS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF THE RESPONDENT(S) IN PROVIDING SIMILAR SERVICES TO ENTITIES COMPARABLE TO THE TOWN	25	24
RESPONDENT'S TRACK RECORD OF ON TIME AND WITHIN BUDGET PROJECT PERFORMANCE	25	23
COMPLIANCE WITH THE RESPONSE PREPARATION AND SUBMISSION REQUIREMENTS	10	7
TOTAL POINTS	100	94

Additional Notes:

PROVIDER HAD NO POWERPOINTS. WERE EXPERIENCE TO STAFF.
WENT A LITTLE OVER TIME LIMIT IN PM.



Town of Cutler Bay
Finance Department
 10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
 Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
 Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
 Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

Firm's Name: **Public Resources Advisory Group**

Committee Member: ALFREDO QUINTERO
 11:30 - 12:10 PM

RFQ #19-02
FINANCIAL ADVISORY SERVICES
(Oral Presentation Date – 3/27/2019)

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
CREDENTIALS, PROFESSIONAL CERTIFICATIONS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF PROJECT MANAGER AND KEY MEMBERS OF THE TEAM	40	40
QUALITY OF THE PROJECTS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF THE RESPONDENT(S) IN PROVIDING SIMILAR SERVICES TO ENTITIES COMPARABLE TO THE TOWN	25	25
RESPONDENT'S TRACK RECORD OF ON TIME AND WITHIN BUDGET PROJECT PERFORMANCE	25	24
COMPLIANCE WITH THE RESPONSE PREPARATION AND SUBMISSION REQUIREMENTS	10	10
TOTAL POINTS	100	99

Additional Notes:

PROVIDED HARD COPY OF FABRICATION. PROVIDED POWERPOINTS. WELL EXPERIENCED SMITH.
 STATED ON TIME LIMIT OF FABRICATION



Town of Cutler Bay
Finance Department
 10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
 Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
 Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
 Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

Firm's Name: **Estrada Hinojosa & Co., Inc.**

Committee Member: **ALFREDO QUINTERO**
 10:50 - 11:20 AM

RFQ #19-02
FINANCIAL ADVISORY SERVICES
(Oral Presentation Date – 3/27/2019)

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
CREDENTIALS, PROFESSIONAL CERTIFICATIONS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF PROJECT MANAGER AND KEY MEMBERS OF THE TEAM	40	40
QUALITY OF THE PROJECTS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF THE RESPONDENT(S) IN PROVIDING SIMILAR SERVICES TO ENTITIES COMPARABLE TO THE TOWN	25	25
RESPONDENT'S TRACK RECORD OF ON TIME AND WITHIN BUDGET PROJECT PERFORMANCE	25	25
COMPLIANCE WITH THE RESPONSE PREPARATION AND SUBMISSION REQUIREMENTS	10	0
TOTAL POINTS	100	90

Additional Notes:

PROVIDED HARDCOPY OF PRESENTATION. PROVIDED POWERPOINT BUT IT WAS OBSERVED NOT TO USE IT. WELL EXPERIENCED STAFF, WENT OVERTIME IN ORAL PRESENTATION

Firm's Name: **Masterson Advisors**

Town of Cutler Bay
Finance Department
 10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
 Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
 Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
 Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

Committee Member: ALFREDO QUINTERO
 9:00 - 9:22 AM

RFQ #19-02
FINANCIAL ADVISORY SERVICES
(Oral Presentation Date – 3/27/2019)

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
CREDENTIALS, PROFESSIONAL CERTIFICATIONS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF PROJECT MANAGER AND KEY MEMBERS OF THE TEAM	40	40
QUALITY OF THE PROJECTS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF THE RESPONDENT(S) IN PROVIDING SIMILAR SERVICES TO ENTITIES COMPARABLE TO THE TOWN	25	25
RESPONDENT'S TRACK RECORD OF ON TIME AND WITHIN BUDGET PROJECT PERFORMANCE	25	23
COMPLIANCE WITH THE RESPONSE PREPARATION AND SUBMISSION REQUIREMENTS	10	7
TOTAL POINTS	100	95

Additional Notes:

PROVIDED HANDWRITTEN, NO POWERPOINT. VERY EXPERIENCED GROUP.
 WENT A LITTLE OVER TIME LIMIT IN ORAL



Town of Cutler Bay
Finance Department
 10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
 Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
 Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
 Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

Firm's Name: **Masterson Advisors**

Committee Member: Robert Daddario

RFQ #19-02
FINANCIAL ADVISORY SERVICES
(Oral Presentation Date – 3/27/2019)

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
CREDENTIALS, PROFESSIONAL CERTIFICATIONS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF PROJECT MANAGER AND KEY MEMBERS OF THE TEAM	40	38
QUALITY OF THE PROJECTS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF THE RESPONDENT(S) IN PROVIDING SIMILAR SERVICES TO ENTITIES COMPARABLE TO THE TOWN	25	23
RESPONDENT'S TRACK RECORD OF ON TIME AND WITHIN BUDGET PROJECT PERFORMANCE	25	20
COMPLIANCE WITH THE RESPONSE PREPARATION AND SUBMISSION REQUIREMENTS	10	10
TOTAL POINTS	100	91

Additional Notes:



Town of Cutler Bay
Finance Department
 10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
 Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
 Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
 Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

Firm's Name: **Estrada Hinojosa & Co., Inc.**

Committee Member: Robert Daddario

RFQ #19-02
FINANCIAL ADVISORY SERVICES
(Oral Presentation Date – 3/27/2019)

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
CREDENTIALS, PROFESSIONAL CERTIFICATIONS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF PROJECT MANAGER AND KEY MEMBERS OF THE TEAM	40	37
QUALITY OF THE PROJECTS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF THE RESPONDENT(S) IN PROVIDING SIMILAR SERVICES TO ENTITIES COMPARABLE TO THE TOWN	25	23
RESPONDENT'S TRACK RECORD OF ON TIME AND WITHIN BUDGET PROJECT PERFORMANCE	25	20
COMPLIANCE WITH THE RESPONSE PREPARATION AND SUBMISSION REQUIREMENTS	10	10
TOTAL POINTS	100	90

Additional Notes:



Town of Cutler Bay
Finance Department
 10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
 Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
 Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
 Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

Firm's Name: **Hilltop Securities**

Committee Member: Robert Daddario

RFQ #19-02
FINANCIAL ADVISORY SERVICES
(Oral Presentation Date – 3/27/2019)

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
CREDENTIALS, PROFESSIONAL CERTIFICATIONS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF PROJECT MANAGER AND KEY MEMBERS OF THE TEAM	40	36
QUALITY OF THE PROJECTS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF THE RESPONDENT(S) IN PROVIDING SIMILAR SERVICES TO ENTITIES COMPARABLE TO THE TOWN	25	23
RESPONDENT'S TRACK RECORD OF ON TIME AND WITHIN BUDGET PROJECT PERFORMANCE	25	20
COMPLIANCE WITH THE RESPONSE PREPARATION AND SUBMISSION REQUIREMENTS	10	10
TOTAL POINTS	100	89

Additional Notes:



Town of Cutler Bay
Finance Department
 10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
 Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
 Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
 Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

Firm's Name: **Public Resources Advisory Group**

Committee Member: Robert Daddario

RFQ #19-02
FINANCIAL ADVISORY SERVICES
(Oral Presentation Date – 3/27/2019)

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
CREDENTIALS, PROFESSIONAL CERTIFICATIONS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF PROJECT MANAGER AND KEY MEMBERS OF THE TEAM	40	37
QUALITY OF THE PROJECTS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF THE RESPONDENT(S) IN PROVIDING SIMILAR SERVICES TO ENTITIES COMPARABLE TO THE TOWN	25	20
RESPONDENT'S TRACK RECORD OF ON TIME AND WITHIN BUDGET PROJECT PERFORMANCE	25	20
COMPLIANCE WITH THE RESPONSE PREPARATION AND SUBMISSION REQUIREMENTS	10	10
TOTAL POINTS	100	87

Additional Notes:

**Town of Cutler Bay****Finance Department**

10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105

Cutler Bay, FL 33189

Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251

Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

RFQ #19-02, Financial Advisory Services

	Respondent				
	Hilltop Securities	PFM Group	Estrada Hinojosa	Masterson Advisors	Public Resources Advisory Group
RFQ - WRITTEN EVALUATION					
Committee Member:					
Robert Daddario	89	85	92	88	89
Alfredo Quintero	100	97	100	95	99
Lakeesha Morris	93	81	98	98	100
Gross RFQ - Written Score	<u>282</u>	<u>263</u>	<u>290</u>	<u>281</u>	<u>288</u>
Average RFQ - Written Score	94.00	87.67	96.67	93.67	96.00
Weighting Percentage	<u>75%</u>	<u>75%</u>	<u>75%</u>	<u>75%</u>	<u>75%</u>
RFQ - Written Score	<u>70.50</u>	<u>65.75</u>	<u>72.50</u>	<u>70.25</u>	<u>72.00</u>
RFQ - ORAL PRESENTATION EVALUATION					
Committee Member:					
Robert Daddario	89	N/A	90	91	87
Alfredo Quintero	94	N/A	98	95	99
Lakeesha Morris	95	N/A	90	95	90
Gross RFQ - Oral Presentation Score	<u>278</u>	<u>0</u>	<u>278</u>	<u>281</u>	<u>276</u>
Average RFQ - Oral Presentation Score	92.67	0.00	92.67	93.67	92.00
Weighting Percentage	<u>25%</u>	<u>25%</u>	<u>25%</u>	<u>25%</u>	<u>25%</u>
RFQ - Oral Presentation Score	<u>23.17</u>	<u>0.00</u>	<u>23.17</u>	<u>23.42</u>	<u>23.00</u>
TOTAL RFQ EVALUATION SCORE	<u>93.67</u>	<u>65.75</u>	<u>95.67</u>	<u>93.67</u>	<u>95.00</u>