



Public Works Department

Alfredo Quintero Jr., EI, CFM, CGC, CCC
Public Works Director
ISA Certified Arborist

MEMORANDUM

Date: December 07, 2015

To: Rafael Casals, Town Manager

From: Selection Committee Members: Alfredo Quintero, Committee Chair
Yenier Vega
Kathryn Lyon

Reference: RFQ#15-12 HVAC Equipment and Controls

Please be advised on November 17, 2015 at 2:00 PM the Selection Committee members met to evaluate the proposals in response to RFQ #15-12. After tabulating each of the member's evaluations (See Attachment "A"), the firms ranked as follows:

<u>Consulting Firm:</u>	<u>Total Points</u>
1. TLC Engineering for Architecture, Inc.	66.00
2. Wolfberg Alvarez & Partners	66.12
3. Basulto & Associates Consulting Engineers	33.87

In accordance with section 3.3 of RFQ #15-12 the highest ranked two (2) consultants were invited for a 30 minute Oral presentation. The Oral presentations took place on December 03, 2015 from 9:00 AM and 11:00 AM. Each of the Selection Committee Member's individually ranked the Firms on the Oral Presentations. The Oral presentation is worth twenty-five percent (25%) of the average score in the final scoring and the original response evaluation is worth seventy-five percent (75%) of the average score in the final scoring. After tabulating the results (See Attachment "B"), the top two (2) consultants re-ranked as follows:

<u>Consulting Firm:</u>	<u>Total Points</u>
1. TLC Engineering for Architecture, Inc.	88.50
2. Wolfberg Alvarez & Partners	79.08

In accordance with section 3.4 of RFQ #15-12 the highest ranked consultant shall be selected to enter into negotiations with the Town for the Scope of Services outlined in Section 2.2 of RFQ #15-12. Based on the Selection Committee's ranking for RFQ #15-12 it is the committee's final recommendation to select the following firm for the Cutler Bay Town Center HVAC Equipment and Controls (Design, Bidding and Construction Management Services):

Consulting Firm:

TLC Engineering for Architecture, Inc.





**Town of Cutler Bay
Public Works Department**

10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

**RFQ #15-12
HVAC Equipment and Controls
Evaluation Criteria
Short List Selection**

FIRM NAME	KATHRYN LYON	ALFREDO QUINTERO	YENIER VEGA	AVERAGE SCORE	
Basulto & Associates Consulting Engineers	33	45.75	22.87	33.87 /	③
TLC Engineering for Architecture, INC.	70.5	70.5	57.00	66.0 /	①
Wolfberg Alvarez & Partners	64.5	71.25	47.62	61.12 /	②



Consultant's Name: TLC ENGINEERING FOR ARCHITECTURE

Committee Member: ALFREDO QUINERA

**Town of Cutler Bay
Public Works Department**

10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
Cutler Bay, Florida 33189

Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251

Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

**RFQ #15-12
HVAC Equipment and Controls
Evaluation Criteria (75% of Score)**

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
Quality of the projects and accomplishments of the respondent(s) in providing similar Design, Bidding and Construction Management Services to comparable Multi-Story Buildings.	30	30
Respondent's track record of on time and within budget project performance.	20	20
Respondent's experience in designing LEED and/or Green Globe Certified HVAC Projects.	25	25
Credentials and accomplishments of the proposed team (up to 3) members.	15	15
Respondent must be able to demonstrate that it has been Certified as a Minority Business Enterprise as defined by Section 288.703, F.S. For purposes of this section, the actual consultant submitting a response must be the entity that is certified.	5	0
Compliance with the response preparation and submission requirements.	5	4
TOTAL POINTS	100	94 x 0.75 = 70.5

Additional Notes:

NO MINORITY BUSINESS ENTERPRISE CERTIFICATE PROVIDED. NO INSURANCE CERTIFICATES PROVIDED.



Consultant's Name: WOLBERG AWARIZ & PARTNER

**Town of Cutler Bay
Public Works Department**

10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

Committee Member: ALFREDO QUINTERO

**RFQ #15-12
HVAC Equipment and Controls
Evaluation Criteria (75% of Score)**

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
Quality of the projects and accomplishments of the respondent(s) in providing similar Design, Bidding and Construction Management Services to comparable Multi-Story Buildings.	30	30
Respondent's track record of on time and within budget project performance.	20	20
Respondent's experience in designing LEED and/or Green Globe Certified HVAC Projects.	25	25
Credentials and accomplishments of the proposed team (up to 3) members.	15	15
Respondent must be able to demonstrate that it has been Certified as a Minority Business Enterprise as defined by Section 288.703, F.S. For purposes of this section, the actual consultant submitting a response must be the entity that is certified.	5	1
Compliance with the response preparation and submission requirements.	5	4
TOTAL POINTS	100	95 x 0.75 = 71.25

Additional Notes:

THE RESPONSE PACKAGE MENTIONS BEING A MINORITY OWNED S.F. ARCHITECTURAL & ENGINEERING FIRM, BUT NO MINORITY BUSINESS ENTERPRISE CERTIFICATE WAS PROVIDED. NO INSURANCE CERTIFICATES PROVIDED.



Consultant's Name: BASULTO & ASSOCIATES

**Town of Cutler Bay
Public Works Department**

10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

Committee Member: ALFREDO QUINTERO

**RFQ #15-12
HVAC Equipment and Controls
Evaluation Criteria (75% of Score)**

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
Quality of the projects and accomplishments of the respondent(s) in providing similar Design, Bidding and Construction Management Services to comparable Multi-Story Buildings.	30	15
Respondent's track record of on time and within budget project performance.	20	10
Respondent's experience in designing LEED and/or Green Globe Certified HVAC Projects.	25	25
Credentials and accomplishments of the proposed team (up to 3) members.	15	10
Respondent must be able to demonstrate that it has been Certified as a Minority Business Enterprise as defined by Section 288.703, F.S. For purposes of this section, the actual consultant submitting a response must be the entity that is certified.	5	0
Compliance with the response preparation and submission requirements.	5	1
TOTAL POINTS	100	61 x 0.75 = 45.75

Additional Notes:

NO SPECIFIC PROJECT ACCOMPLISHMENTS PROVIDED SUCH AS PROJECT ON TIME AND ON BUDGET FOR THE PROJECTS LISTED. IN ITEM (7) NO NARRATIVES PROVIDED ON SPECIFIC PROJECTS COMPLETED IN THE LAST 5 YEARS. IN ITEM (8) NO DESCRIPTION OF PROJECTS PROVIDING SERVICES SIMILAR TO THOSE IDENTIFIED IN THE SCOPE OF SERVICES IN THE LAST 5 YEARS. IN ITEM (9) THE ARTICLES PROVIDED ARE NOT RELATED TO PROJECTS COMPLETED IN FLORIDA. NO MINORITY BUSINESS ENTERPRISE CERTIFICATE PROVIDED. NO INSURANCE CERTIFICATES PROVIDED. RESPONSE PACKAGE WAS INCOMPLETE.



Consultant's Name: TLC

Committee Member: K. LYON

**Town of Cutler Bay
Public Works Department**

10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

**RFQ #15-12
HVAC Equipment and Controls
Evaluation Criteria (75% of Score)**

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
Quality of the projects and accomplishments of the respondent(s) in providing similar Design, Bidding and Construction Management Services to comparable Multi-Story Buildings.	30	30
Respondent's track record of on time and within budget project performance.	20	20
Respondent's experience in designing LEED and/or Green Globe Certified HVAC Projects.	25	25
Credentials and accomplishments of the proposed team (up to 3) members.	15	15
Respondent must be able to demonstrate that it has been Certified as a Minority Business Enterprise as defined by Section 288.703, F.S. For purposes of this section, the actual consultant submitting a response must be the entity that is certified.	5	0
Compliance with the response preparation and submission requirements.	5	4
TOTAL POINTS	100	94 x 0.75 = 70.5

Additional Notes:

#3 - org. chart not showing extent of availability, however states 40% overall

No Minority Certificate provided



Consultant's Name: Wolfberg

Committee Member: K. LYON

**Town of Cutler Bay
Public Works Department**

10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

**RFQ #15-12
HVAC Equipment and Controls
Evaluation Criteria (75% of Score)**

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
Quality of the projects and accomplishments of the respondent(s) in providing similar Design, Bidding and Construction Management Services to comparable Multi-Story Buildings.	30	29
Respondent's track record of on time and within budget project performance.	20	20
Respondent's experience in designing LEED and/or Green Globe Certified HVAC Projects.	25	20
Credentials and accomplishments of the proposed team (up to 3) members.	15	15
Respondent must be able to demonstrate that it has been Certified as a Minority Business Enterprise as defined by Section 288.703, F.S. For purposes of this section, the actual consultant submitting a response must be the entity that is certified.	5	0
Compliance with the response preparation and submission requirements.	5	2
TOTAL POINTS	100	86 x 0.75 = 64.5

Additional Notes:

- #3 - Org. chart not showing extent of availability
 - #4 - 2 page history of firm not employees as required
 - #9 - No state license
 - #10 - No state license
- 0 - NO minority ~~firm~~ certificate



Consultant's Name: BASULTO

Committee Member: K. LYON

**Town of Cutler Bay
Public Works Department**

10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

**RFQ #15-12
HVAC Equipment and Controls
Evaluation Criteria (75% of Score)**

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
Quality of the projects and accomplishments of the respondent(s) in providing similar Design, Bidding and Construction Management Services to comparable Multi-Story Buildings.	30	28
Respondent's track record of on time and within budget project performance.	20	0
Respondent's experience in designing LEED and/or Green Globe Certified HVAC Projects.	25	0
Credentials and accomplishments of the proposed team (up to 3) members.	15	14
Respondent must be able to demonstrate that it has been Certified as a Minority Business Enterprise as defined by Section 288.703, F.S. For purposes of this section, the actual consultant submitting a response must be the entity that is certified.	5	0
Compliance with the response preparation and submission requirements.	5	2
TOTAL POINTS	100	44 x 0.75 = 33

Additional Notes:

#3 - Org. chart not showing extent of availability #7 missing 0 - NO track record listed on time w/in budget
 #8 - Missing 0 - No experience LEED or Green Globe
 #9 - 1 article written by Basulto 0 - No minority certificate
 #10 - No proof of authorization to transact business in FL.



Consultant's Name: TLC ENGINEERING

**Town of Cutler Bay
Public Works Department**

10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

Committee Member: YENIER VETOA

**RFQ #15-12
HVAC Equipment and Controls
Evaluation Criteria (75% of Score)**

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
Quality of the projects and accomplishments of the respondent(s) in providing similar Design, Bidding and Construction Management Services to comparable Multi-Story Buildings.	30	6
Respondent's track record of on time and within budget project performance.	20	20
Respondent's experience in designing LEED and/or Green Globe Certified HVAC Projects.	25	25
Credentials and accomplishments of the proposed team (up to 3) members.	15	15
Respondent must be able to demonstrate that it has been Certified as a Minority Business Enterprise as defined by Section 288.703, F.S. For purposes of this section, the actual consultant submitting a response must be the entity that is certified.	5	5
Compliance with the response preparation and submission requirements.	5	5
TOTAL POINTS	100	x 0.75 = 57

Additional Notes:

Firm project team consisted of all PEs with leed certification. Firms team had the most experience. Firm has most leed projects. provided examples of 12 projects with same and/or similar scope.



Consultant's Name: WOLFBERG ALVAREZ

**Town of Cutler Bay
Public Works Department**

10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

Committee Member: YENIER VEZA

**RFQ #15-12
HVAC Equipment and Controls
Evaluation Criteria (75% of Score)**

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
Quality of the projects and accomplishments of the respondent(s) in providing similar Design, Bidding and Construction Management Services to comparable Multi-Story Buildings.	30	30
Respondent's track record of on time and within budget project performance.	20	15
Respondent's experience in designing LEED and/or Green Globe Certified HVAC Projects.	25	2
Credentials and accomplishments of the proposed team (up to 3) members.	15	7.5
Respondent must be able to demonstrate that it has been Certified as a Minority Business Enterprise as defined by Section 288.703, F.S. For purposes of this section, the actual consultant submitting a response must be the entity that is certified.	5	5
Compliance with the response preparation and submission requirements.	5	4
TOTAL POINTS	100	x 0.75 = 47.62

Additional Notes:

FIRM HAD MOST PROJECTS IDENTIFIED MINIMAL LEED PROJECTS



Consultant's Name: Basulto & Associates

Committee Member: YENIER VEGA

**Town of Cutler Bay
Public Works Department**

10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

**RFQ #15-12
HVAC Equipment and Controls
Evaluation Criteria (75% of Score)**

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
Quality of the projects and accomplishments of the respondent(s) in providing similar Design, Bidding and Construction Management Services to comparable Multi-Story Buildings.	30	0
Respondent's track record of on time and within budget project performance.	20	7.5
Respondent's experience in designing LEED and/or Green Globe Certified HVAC Projects.	25	0
Credentials and accomplishments of the proposed team (up to 3) members.	15	15
Respondent must be able to demonstrate that it has been Certified as a Minority Business Enterprise as defined by Section 288.703, F.S. For purposes of this section, the actual consultant submitting a response must be the entity that is certified.	5	5
Compliance with the response preparation and submission requirements.	5	3
TOTAL POINTS	100	x 0.75 = 22.87

Additional Notes:

NO LEED projects submitted, Did not focus on Section 8 projects.



**Town of Cutler Bay
Public Works Department**

10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

**RFQ #15-12
HVAC Equipment and Controls
Oral Presentation – 12/3/2015
Short List Selection**

FIRM NAME	KATHRYN LYON	ALFREDO QUINTERO	YENIER VEGA	AVERAGE SCORE	
TLC Engineering for Architecture, INC.	93.5	90	82	88.5	①
Wolfberg Alvarez & Partners	86.5	84.12	66.62	79.08	②



Consultant's Name: TLC ENGINEERING

Committee Member: ALFREDO QUINTERO

**Town of Cutler Bay
Public Works Department**

10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

**RFQ #15-12
HVAC Equipment and Controls
Evaluation Criteria
Oral Presentation Date –December 3, 2015**

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
Power Point Presentation	10	10
Execution of Presentation	10	10
Responses to Questions	5	4
TOTAL POINTS	25	24

Final Score

Evaluation Criteria	+	Oral Presentation	=	Final Total Points
66.0	+	24	=	90

Additional Notes:

SHOWCASED A PRO MODELING ISOMETRIC OF BUILDING IN POWERPOINT PRESENTATION. THEY SPECULATE A PROPOSED 36% SAVINGS IN ENERGY CONSUMPTION WITH SYSTEM THEY WANT TO DESIGN. FINISHED PRESENTATION IN UNDER 20 MINUTES.



Consultant's Name: WOLFBERG ALVAREZ

**Town of Cutler Bay
Public Works Department**

10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

Committee Member: ALFREDO QUINTERO

**RFQ #15-12
HVAC Equipment and Controls
Evaluation Criteria
Oral Presentation Date –December 3, 2015**

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
Power Point Presentation	10	10
Execution of Presentation	10	9
Responses to Questions	5	4
TOTAL POINTS	25	23

Final Score

Evaluation Criteria	+	Oral Presentation	=	Final Total Points
61.12	+	23	=	84.12

Additional Notes:

WORKED & DESIGNED TOWN COUNCIL CHAMBERS.
FINISHED PRESENTATION IN UNDER 20 MINUTES.



Consultant's Name: TLC

Committee Member: K. LYON

**Town of Cutler Bay
Public Works Department**

10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

**RFQ #15-12
HVAC Equipment and Controls
Evaluation Criteria
Oral Presentation Date –December 3, 2015**

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
Power Point Presentation	10	10
Execution of Presentation	10	9
Responses to Questions	5	4
TOTAL POINTS	25	23

Final Score

Evaluation Criteria	+	Oral Presentation	=	Final Total Points
70.5	+	23	=	93.5

Additional Notes:



Consultant's Name: Wolfberg Alvarez

Committee Member: K. LYON

**Town of Cutler Bay
Public Works Department**

10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

**RFQ #15-12
HVAC Equipment and Controls
Evaluation Criteria
Oral Presentation Date –December 3, 2015**

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
Power Point Presentation	10	9
Execution of Presentation	10	8
Responses to Questions	5	5
TOTAL POINTS	25	22

Final Score

Evaluation Criteria	+	Oral Presentation	=	Final Total Points
64.5	+	22	=	86.5

Additional Notes:



Consultant's Name: TLC ENGINEERING & ARCHITECTURE

Committee Member: YENNER VEGA

**Town of Cutler Bay
Public Works Department**

10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

**RFQ #15-12
HVAC Equipment and Controls
Evaluation Criteria
Oral Presentation Date –December 3, 2015**

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
Power Point Presentation	10	10
Execution of Presentation	10	10
Responses to Questions	5	5
TOTAL POINTS	25	25

Final Score

Evaluation Criteria	+	Oral Presentation	=	Final Total Points
57	+	25	=	82

Additional Notes:

Firm is ready to work; very familiar with energy projects; most team members are LEED certified. modeled the building for energy savings (potential).



Consultant's Name: WOLFBERG ALVAREZ

Committee Member: YENIER VERA

**Town of Cutler Bay
Public Works Department**

10720 Caribbean Blvd., Suite 105
Cutler Bay, Florida 33189
Phone: (305) 234-4262 Fax: (305) 234-4251
Website: www.cutlerbay-fl.gov

**RFQ #15-12
HVAC Equipment and Controls
Evaluation Criteria
Oral Presentation Date –December 3, 2015**

CATEGORIES	MAX POINTS	AWARDED POINTS
Power Point Presentation	10	7
Execution of Presentation	10	7
Responses to Questions	5	5
TOTAL POINTS	25	19

Final Score

Evaluation Criteria	+	Oral Presentation	=	Final Total Points
47.62	+	19	=	66.62

Additional Notes:

FIRM IS READY TO WORK; various similar projects.